

Anuario de Historia de la Iglesia

Universidad de Navarra

ahig@unav.es

ISSN (Versión impresa): 1133-0104

ESPAÑA

2000

Juan R. Véles Giraldo

THE CHURCH IN SPANISH AMERICA AND THE «CATHOLIC HISTORICAL
REVIEW»

Anuario de Historia de la Iglesia, año/vol. IX

Universidad de Navarra

Pamplona, España

pp. 373-379

Red de Revistas Científicas de América Latina y el Caribe, España y Portugal

Universidad Autónoma del Estado de México

The Church in Spanish America and the *Catholic Historical Review*

Juan R. VÉLEZ GIRALDO

The *Catholic Historical Review* is a journal edited by the American Catholic Historical Association and published by The Catholic University Press of America. It has been published since 1915 with quarterly editions. The primary aim of the *Catholic Historical Review* from its start was, and continues to be, the study of the history of the Catholic Church in the United States. The American Historical Association was started in 1884, one year after Pope Leo XIII gave a strong support to historical research of Church life by opening the Vatican Archives. In the face of ideological historiography he wrote «that the first law of history is, not to dare to utter falsehood; the second, not to fear speak the truth; and moreover, no room must be left for suspicion of partiality or prejudice»¹.

Many Catholic scholars felt the need for this type of publication following a host of European journals that had began to provide abundant ecclesiastical historiography². A bibliography of texts on Church History, published between 1918 and 1920 indicates the absence of books on American Church History in general. It shows that the majority of books published during this period were on early Church History, Ante-Nicene and Post-Nicene Church History, the early Middle Ages and the High Middle Ages, the Reformation and the Counter-Reformation. The bibliography suggests that the history of the Church in America

1. Pope Leo's letter to Cardinals di Luca, Pitra and Hergensroether found in English in the Ave Maria «Notre Dame» XIX (1883) 741, 761 and here cited from GUILDAY, Peter, *The American Catholic Historical Association*, in «Catholic Historical Review» VI, n. 1 (1920) 5.

2. Patrick J. Healey mentions among the mayor ones following publications²: the *Revue d'Histoire Ecclesiastique (accent to the right)* (Louvain, 1900-1913), *Revue des Questiones Historiques* (Paris, 1866-1914), the *Revue Benedictine (on both e also)* (Abbaye de Maredsous in Belgium, 1884-1914), *Stimmen aus Maria-Laach* (Herder, Freiburg, Germany, edited since 1871), *Historisches Jahrbuch* (Munster, since 1880), *The Irish Theological Quarterly* (Dublin, since 1906), and *Revista Storico-Critica delle Scienze Teologiche* (Rome, since 1906). He also mentions a host of other publications which are review with a national character. Cf. HEALY, Patrick Joseph, *Recent Activities of Catholic Historians*, in the «Catholic Historical Review», New Series II, 2 (1992) 169-179, The Catholic University of America, Washington D.C.

Juan R. Vélez Giraldo

was almost ignored³. It contains but a few references to short notes on the Pilgrim Fathers and to a book on Christianity in the modern world⁴.

The present day absence of journal articles on the Church History of the United States between the late 16th and mid 18th century, particularly the contribution of the Spanish orders and the *Patronato Real* is strikingly evident. Some historians have even condemned as a whole the Spanish enterprise in America. Popular knowledge echoes today what one wrote in the first quarter of this century: «It is not often that a school history of the United States fails to describe the inhumanity of the Spaniards. That those conquerors destroyed most of the natives of the West Indies is perfectly true. Their own historians attest it. It likewise is a fact that on the mainland the *repartimientos* or allotment system was often pitiless in its waste of aborigines»⁵. Although the same author later praises the achievements of some men such as Las Casas he fails to give credit to many other Spanish missionaries, bishops, and at times governors, who denounced the abuse of the natives, sought their protection, and introduced important spiritual and cultural contributions to the Indian cultures.

The journal articles of the *Catholic Historical Review* deal with Church History mainly in three geographical areas, the United States, Europe and Spanish America. The articles from the third group are predominantly on Mexican and South American Church History. There are very few articles on the Church in Central America. Since the start of the journal there have been over eight hundred articles. Fifty-six articles are related to the Spanish evangelization of America and out of these thirteen are directly related to the work of Spanish missionaries within the present day territory of the United States.

The missionary work of Spanish religious orders in the United States constitutes a long and important chapter of the history of the Catholic Church in the United States. However, most textbooks of Catholic Church History do not describe the Spanish missions in the current territory of the United States, and devote very few pages to the Church in United States. The *Catholic Historical Review* has supplied some of the information lacking, and provided a necessary source for the publication of research on these missions. Most of the articles on the missions are from the first half of the century. In general their tone is not polemical or partial, and they present valuable archival records. Seven of the thirteen articles on Spanish American missions are on the work of Franciscan and Jesuit orders that worked in Florida, New Mexico, Texas and California.

Oddly there are no articles on Fr. Junipero Serra, the great Spanish Evangelizer of Upper California or on the Jesuit Martyrs under Fr. Segura who traveled from Florida to the Chesapeake Bay in 1566. There are only a few articles on some of the most outstanding missionaries such as Fr. Fermin Lasuen. The *Catholic Historical Review* has no articles on the

3. WHITMAN, W.F., *A Church History Bibliography 1918 to 1920*, in the «Catholic Historical Review», *ibid.*, n. 3, 333-336.

4. MOORE, E.C., *The Spread of Christianity in the Modern World*, Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1919.

5. MCCARTHY-Charles HALLAN, *The Importance of stresses and omissions in the writing of American History* in the, «Catholic Historical Review» IV, 1 (1924) 30.

The Church in Spanish America and the «Catholic Historical Review»

Franciscan priests who opened and directed the missions of New Mexico at the start of the 17th century and the ones of Texas at the close of the same century.

The subject matter of the articles on the Church History in Spanish America vary greatly, including the *capellanías*, the black legend, the Bull *Inter caetera*, and nuns in colonial Mexico. There are three articles on the work of the Jesuits in different countries. Four articles are devoted to Christopher Columbus and the motives for voyaging to America, his writing on prophecies and the funding for his voyages. In light of the large number of institutions and figures in the history of the New World, this interest in Columbus seems disproportionately high.

The articles on the history of the Catholic Church in the United States often begin with the first quarter of the 1800's. Many articles are on historiography, individual bishops, and outstanding Catholics. A number of articles are devoted to Bishop John Carrol, some to Catholic European immigrants, and a few to the French Jesuits. In these there is scant if any reference to the work of earlier Spanish missionaries. There is a marked absence of articles on the religious and social conditions of Indian tribes and especially the Indians partially evangelized by the Spanish.

A review of this publication indicates that the early history of the Church in the United States is almost entirely limited to the history of the European immigrants who settled in the Eastern coast of North America. In addition, it suggests that the Spanish American missions in Florida, New Mexico, Texas and California are poorly known and have gained little attention among Church historians. A similar conclusion could be reached with regard to the religious fate of the Indians of these regions during the 19th century.

In an address to the Catholic Historical Society in 1943, Richard Pattet said that «Hispanic America has been dominated by the heritage and tradition of Spain. The *patronato* is an excellent example. Yet, how little is it studied or even mentioned except in passing and, as a result what do we have?»⁶. When it is, «The wealth of the Church is studied..., but not its role in the education and welfare which she bore almost exclusively for centuries»⁷. There are a number of plausible reasons for this omission: historians have been biased against Spanish heritage in America due to the criticism raised by Las Casas and other early missionaries; most scholars have placed their attention on the European Catholics who settled North America; little importance has been paid to the Spanish missions because they involved Indians who soon became a small percentage of the population.

In sum, the *Catholic Historical Review* has relatively few articles on the Spanish American Missions in the present territory of the United States and on the Catholic Church in Spanish America, and none dealing exclusively with native Americans. However, the articles published provide valuable insight and an objective outlook into the Spanish contribution to the first Evangelization of the American continent. The ones on the missions in the United States offer a useful bibliography for future studies, and are of greater historical interest than the brief general accounts on the Catholic Church in various countries of Spanish America.

6. PATTEE, Richard, *A Revisionist approach to Hispanic American Studies*, XXIX, 4 (1944) 441.

7. *Ibid.*

Juan R. Vélez Giraldo

I. *Titles of articles on Spanish American Missions in the United States that have appeared in the «Catholic Historical Review» from 1915 to 1999.*

Conquistadores

O'HAGAN, Thomas, *Following the Conquistadores*, 1916, vol. II, n. 3, 258-268.

Florida Missions

MATTER, Robert Allen, *Mission Life in seventeenth Century Florida*, 1981, vol. LXVII, 401-420.

CONNOLLY, Mathew J., *Four Contemporary Narratives of the Founding of St. Augustine*, 1965, vol. LI, n. 3, 305-334.

GANNON, Michael, *Sebastian Montero, Pioneer American Missionary, 1566-1572*, 1965, vol. LI, n. 3, 335-353.

SPELLMAN, Charles W., *The «Golden Age» of the Florida Missions, 1632-1674*, in the «Catholic Historical Review» 1965, vol. LI, n. 3, 354-372.

GANNON, Michael V., *Mission of Nombre de Dios Library*, *ibid*, 373-378.

ROBERSTON, James A., *Notes on early Church Government in Spanish Florida*, 1931, vol. XVII, n. 2, 151-174.

False Legends

STECK, Francis Borgia, *Some recent trends and findings in the History of the Spanish Colonial Empire in America*, 1942, vol. XXVIII, n. 1, 13-42. A criticism of the false legends of the ill treatment of the Indians.

Franciscans

CASTAÑEDA, Carlos E., *Pioneers in Sackcloth*, 1939, vol. XXV, n. 3, 309-420. On the Franciscan missions throughout North America.

PRIESTLEY, Herbert Ingram, *Franciscan Exploration of California*, 1920, vol. VI, n. 2, 139-155.

CHAPMAN, Charles E., *A Great Franciscan in California: Fermin Francisco de Lasúen*, 1919, vol. V, n. 2-3, 131-155. On Lasúen's expansion of the missionary work begun by St. Junipero Serra.

Hierarchy

RYAN, Edwin, *Diocesan Organization in Spanish Colonies*, 1918, vol. IV, n. 2, 170-185. This is a brief account on each of the bishops during the Spanish settlement of Florida. Ryan cites Barcia's *Ensayo Cronológico para la Historia General de la Florida*, Madrid, 1723.

KLEIN, Julius, *The Church in Spanish American History*, 1917, vol. III, n. 3, 290-307.

RYAN, Edwin, *Diocesan Organization in the Spanish Colonies*, 1916-1917, vol. II, n. 2, 146-156.

O'DANIEL, V. F. *The Right Rev. Juan de las cabezas de Altamirano: The First Bishop to visit the Present Territory of the United States (1562-1615)*, 1917, vol. III, n. 4, 400-414.

The Church in Spanish America and the «Catholic Historical Review»

ROBERSTON, James A., *Notes on early Church Government in Spanish Florida*, 1931, vol. XVII, n. 2, 151-174.

Jesuits

BOLTON, Herbert E., *The Black Robes of New Spain*, 1935, vol. XXI, n. 3, 257-282. On the martyrdom of Fr. Martínéz in Georgia in 1566, and on the cultural and social contributions that the Jesuits made to the Indians.

DUNNE, Peter, *The Literature of the Jesuits of New Spain*, 1934, vol. XX, n. 3, 248-259.

CHAPMAN, Charles E., *The Jesuits in Baja California, 1697-1768*, 1920, vol. VI, n. 1, 46-58.

CAMPBELL, Thomas J., *Eusebio Kino: 1644-1711*, 1920, vol. V, n. 4, 353-376. On the 17th century Jesuit missionary.

Martyrs

THURSTON, Herbert, *The First beatified Martyr of Spanish America: Blessed Roque Gonzalez (1576-1628)*, 1935, vol. XX, n. 4, 371-383.

Mexico, education

DECORME, Gerardo, *Catholic Education in Mexico 1525-1912*, 1916, vol. II, 168-181.

Missions, conversions

CURTIS, Georgina Pell, *The Early Conversions to the Catholic Church in America 1521-1830*, 1915, vol. I, n. 3, 271-281.

Patronato Real

PATTEE, Richard, *A Revisionist approach to Hispanic American Studies*, 1944, vol. XXIX, n. 4, 431-444.

MECHAM, Lloyd J. *Origins of the Real Patronato de Indias*, 1928, New series vol. VIII, n. 2, 203-227.

Spanish history and culture

WALSH, James J. *Catholic Background of the Discovery of America*, 1927, New Series vol. VII, n. 2, 175-193.

KENNY, Lawrence, *America a Land of Destiny*, 1926, New series, vol. VI, n. 3, 423-447.

FLICK, Lawrence F., *What the American has got out of the melting pot from the Catholic*, 1925, New Series, vol. V, n. 3, 407-430,

ENGLISH, Adrian T., *The Historiography of American Catholic History (1785-1884)*, 1926, New Series, vol. V, n. 4, 561-598.

HALLAN MCCARTHY, Charles, *The Importance of Stresses and omissions in the writing of American History*, 1924, New Series vol. IV, n. 1, 27-46.

Texas

CASTAÑEDA, Carlos E., *Earliest Catholic Activities in Texas*, 1931, vol. XVII, n. 3, 278-295.

II. *Articles on the Catholic Church in Spanish America*

Martyrs

STEVENS-ARROYO, Anthony M., *Juan Mateo Guaticabanú*, September 21, 1496: Evangelization and Martyrdom in the time of Columbus, 1996, vol. LXXXII, no 4, 614-636. On Ramón Pane's work with the Taino Indians and the first native martyrs in Hispaniola.

Columbus

WEST, C., Delno, *Christopher Columbus, Lost Biblical sites and the last crusade*, Vol LXXVIII, no 4, Oct 1992, 519-541. On Columbus' inspiration on Joachim de Fiore, Ubertino da Casale and Arnold of Villanova.

SWEET, Leonard I., *Christopher Columbus and the Millennial Vision of the New World*, 1986, vol. LXXII, n. 3, 369-382. On Spanish pre-reformation Catholicism and millenarism in America.

LOUGHRAN, E. Ward, *Did a priest accompany Columbus in 1492?*, 1930, vol. XVI, n. 2, 164-174.

MCCARTHY, Charles H., *Columbus and the Santa Hermandad in 1492*, 1915, vol. I, n. 1, 38-50.

Evangelizers

TIBESAR, Antoinne, OFM, *The King and the Pope and the Clergy in the Colonial Spanish-American Empire*, vol. LXXV, n. 1, 91-109.

CALLANAN, Leo J., *Father Antonio Viera, S.J. in Brazil*, 1930, vol. XVI, n. 2, 47-67.

O'HARA, John F., *Juan Rodríguez de Fonseca: First president of the Indies (1493-1523)*, 1917, vol. III, n. 2, 131-150.

Black Legend

PESCATELLO, Ann M., *The Leyenda Negra and the African in sixteenth and seventeenth-century Iberian Thought*, 1980, vol. LXVI, no 2, 169-183.

On the English and Dutch political inspiration of the black legend, and on the thought of Francisco de Vitoria and Fray Tomas de Mercado.

MULDOON, James, *Papal Responsibility for the Infidel: another look at Alexander VI's Inter Caetera*, 1978, vol. LXIV, no 2, 168-184.

On the bull as a statement on the nature of Christian-infidel relations, and on the pope's sense of responsibility for the protection and conversion of infidels.

VAN DER KROEF, Justus M., *Francisco de Vitoria and the nature of Colonial Policy*, 1949, vol. XXXV, n. 1, 129-162.

Kings

CRAHAN, Margaret E., *Church-State Conflict in Colonial Peru: Bourbon Regalism under the last of the Hapsburgs*, 1976, vol. LXII, n. 2, 224-244.

The Church in Spanish America and the «Catholic Historical Review»

Capellanias

COSTELOE, Michael P., *A Capellanía in Mexico, 1665-1799, a case history*, 1976, vol. LVII, n. 4, 604-617. *Capellanías* were a source of investment for families and secure income for clerics.

Nuns

LAVRIN, Asuncion, *Values and Meaning of Monastic Life for nuns in colonial Mexico*, 1972, vol. LVIII, n. 3, 367-387. This is a well documented description of the nuns of the colonial period at the end of which there were 2,400 nuns in New Spain.

The Jesuits

GROH, John E., *Antonio Ruiz de Montoya and the early Reductions in the Jesuit Province of Paraguay*, 1970, vol. XVI, n. 3, 501-533.

BREATHETT, George, *Religious Protectionism and the Slave in Haiti*, 1969, vol. LV, n. 1, 26-39. On the Jesuit expulsion from Haiti in 1763.

MILLER, Hubert J., *The Expulsion of the Jesuits from Guatemala in 1871*, 1969, vol. LIV, n. 4, 636-654.

Latin American Countries

ESPINOSA, J. Manuel, *The Role of Catholic Culture in Uruguay*, 1939, vol. XXVI, n. 1, 1-15. This article and the following one deal mainly with the 19th century.

LOUGHRAN, Elizabeth, *The Role of Catholic Church in Bolivia*, *ibid*, 17-50.

LANGFORD, Walter M. *The Role of Catholic Church in Argentina*, *ibid*, 51-66. This article focuses on the 16th and 17th centuries

MCGOWAN, Raymond A., *The Role of Catholic Church in the West Indies*, *ibid*, 183-194. The article deals with the first half of the 20th century.

MAGNER, James A., *The Catholic Church in Colombia*, *ibid*, 195-221. The article is a general historical overview.

RYAN, Edwin, *The Contribution of the Church to the Chilean Culture*, *ibid*, 324-334.

MADDEN, Marie R., *The Role of the Catholic Culture in Venezuela*, *ibid*, 447-468.

WALTERS, Mary, *The colonial missions in Venezuela*, Mary, 1937, vol. XXIII, n. 2, 129-152. On the Franciscan missions in Venezuela.

CULEMANS, J.B., *A Revaluation of Early Peruvian History*, 1917, vol. III, n. 2, 157-167.

CURRIER, Charles Warren, *The Church of Cuba*, 1915, vol. I, n. 2, 128-138.

Universities

CASTAÑEDA, Carlos E., *The beginnings of University Life in America*, 1938, vol. XXIV, n. 2, 153-174.

Juan R. Vélez Giraldo
25 Follen St., Cambridge, Mass. 02138, USA
jrvelez98@aol.com